

# Limits to Privatization

## How to Avoid too Much of a Good Thing

A Report to the Club of Rome

Edited by  
Ernst Ulrich von Weizsacker  
Oran R. Young  
Matthias Finger

With  
Marianne Beisheim

**EARTHSCAN**

London • Sterling, VA

# Contents

<b>List of Figures</b>	viii
<b>List of Boxes</b>	xi
<b>Foreword by the President of the Club of Rome</b> <i>Prince El Hassan Bin Talal</i>	xii
<b>Preface</b> <i>Ernst Ulrich von Weizsacker, Oran R. Young and Matthias Finger</i>	xiv
<b>Editors' Acknowledgements</b>	xvi

## PART I INTRODUCTION

<b>Limits to Privatization</b> <i>Ernst Ulrich von Weizsacker, Oran R. Young, Matthias Finger</i>	3
---	---

## PART II PRIVATIZATION IN MANY SECTORS: CASE STUDIES AND SNAPSHOTS

<b>Initial remarks</b> <i>Oran R. Young</i>	15
---	----

### NATURAL RESOURCES AND RELATED INDUSTRIES

#### Water

Solving water-supply problems in Bolivia: Beyond Cochabamba <i>Ralf Sudhoff</i>	17
A 'Waterl'eau' in Grenoble, France <i>Martin Sturmer</i>	21
Manila: A success story turned sour <i>Dihte Bernhardt</i>	25
Thames Water Utilities Limited, UK <i>Matthias Finger and Roger Levett</i>	27
Water privatization in Tanzania: Mixed results <i>Jiirgen Schejfran</i>	31
Budapest sewage works: Partial privatization of a Central European utility <i>Alexander Juras and Todd Schenk</i>	34
Management success at Rostock, Germany <i>Ernst Ulrich von Weizsacker</i>	39

### III

j <sub>t</sub>	<b>Metals and Cement</b>	
* P <sup>l</sup>	Privatization of the mining sector in Zambia: The case of Zambia Consolidated Copper Mines (ZCCM) <i>Brenda Mojya and Brighton Lubansa</i>	41
se	Saving Sidex Galati steel mills in Romania <i>Black Sea University Foundation</i>	46
ec	Union Miniere Pirdop Copper, Bulgaria: A case of privatization	
J <sub>f</sub>	and the environment <i>Alexander Juras and Todd Schenk</i>	47

### Other Resources

L <sub>(</sub>	The fight against patents on the neem tree <i>Vandana Shiva and Ruth Brand</i>	51
m	The basmati patent <i>Ruth Brand</i>	55
in	Privatizing nature: Plundering biodiversity <i>Aziz Choudry</i>	58
	Private forests in Germany <i>Ernst Ulrich von Weizsacker</i>	61

### III NETWORK INDUSTRIES

p <sub>i</sub>	Energy	
'ti	Enron: Unregulated master of influence <i>Matthias Finger</i>	65
11	The price to pay for deregulation of electricity supply in California <i>Ruth Brand and Jirgen Schejran</i>	66

### pc Telecommunication and Postal Services

^e	Telecommunications in Mexico, Uruguay and Argentina: A tale of contrasts <i>Jochen Boekhoff</i>	72
cr	Privatization of telecommunication in Japan <i>Thomas Thiimmel and Max Thiimmel</i>	76
th	Privatization in outer space: Lessons from Landsat and beyond <i>Jurgen Schejran</i>	79
•	TPG Post: a Dutch privatization success <i>Matthias Finger</i>	84

### ec! Transportation

•	British Rail <i>Martin Weidauer</i>	87
• ^	Economics of transport and privatization <i>Felix R. FitzRoy</i>	92
ff	Japanese National Railways <i>Martin Weidauer</i>	93
,	Regionalization as part of rail restructuring in Germany <i>Martin Weidauer</i>	96
hi	Privatization of the transport sector in Argentina <i>Tim Gurtler</i>	98
st]	Air New Zealand <i>Diwata Olalia Hunziker</i>	102
	Skyguide: A case of cot^ov^xizztion <i>Matthias Finger</i>	104

### gc OTHER SERVICES

su	<b>Waste Disposal</b>	
	No time to waste: How to avoid too much of a bad thing (Germany, Malaysia) <i>Raimund Bleischwitz and Akira Proske</i>	108

**Insurance**

- Abolishing property insurance monopolies in Germany  
 ^ *Thomas von Ungern-Sternberg* 114

**Culture and Media**

- Privatization of Italian cultural heritage *Roland Benedikter* 118  
 The Salzburg Festival: An example of public responsibility and  
 private money *Raffaella Kluge* 122  
 The global media monsters: Private media dominate the world's  
 public sphere *Dusan Reljic* 124

**Health**

- Partial privatization of healthcare in Chile *Olaf Rotthaus* 130  
 Healthcare in the US *Kai Senf* 134  
 Healthcare reform in Zambia *Brighton Lubansa and Brenda Mojya* 137  
 Pharmaceutical research and development for neglected diseases:  
 Market failures and the case of sleeping sickness *Tobias Luppe* 140

**Education**

- Education in Chile *Ernst Hillebrand* 145  
 Community-managed basic education in Guatemala: A solution  
 for the poor? *Sabine Speiser* 147  
 The increasing privatization of universities in Tanzania  
*Verdiana G. Masanja and Michael von Hauff* 151

**Pensions**

- A weak spot in the US private pension system *Beate Klein* 156  
 The Swiss three-pillar pension system *Genevieve Reday-Mulvey* 159

**Police and Security**

- 'Rent a soldier': The privatization of security and war and the  
 case of mercenary companies in Africa *Thomas Thiimmel,*  
*Fabian Fechner and Jurgen Schejfran* 162  
 Privatization of police services in Frankfurt, Germany  
*Tonia Sophie Mu'ller and Simon Stabler* 165  
 Private prisons in the US *John Züchner* 169

**PART III PRIVATIZATION IN CONTEXT**

- Initial remarks** *Oran R. Young* 173

**The General Context**

- Post-war history: The ups and downs of the public sector  
*Ernst Ulrich von Weizsacker* 175  
 The global context: Privatization in a globalizing world  
*Oran R. Young* 190

it	*	<b>The Regional Context</b>	
p <sup>l</sup>		Privatization in G7 countries <i>Matthias Finger</i>	201
se	Privatization	in Latin America <i>Jorge A. Schiavon</i>	207
Cr		Liberalization of services: Experiences of African consumers <i>Nessie R. Golakai</i>	212
eo		No limits? Privatization in Central and Eastern Europe <i>Zsolt Boda</i>	215
j <sub>e</sub>	Privatization	in South Asia <i>Joachim Betz</i>	222
		<b>Special Issues</b>	
Lc		Essential services: Shifting the burden of proof <i>Tim Kessler and Nancy Alexander</i>	228
		Privatization of the infrastructures <i>Matthias Finger</i>	235
inl		The top public service transnational corporations <i>Matthias Finger</i>	239
an		How GATS (General Agreement on Trade in Services) jeopardizes essential services <i>Nancy Alexander and Timothy Kessler</i>	246
"b	Privatization	and development <i>Andreas Obser</i>	252
p <sub>rj</sub>	Privatization	and corruption <i>Frederic Boehm, Juanita Olaya and Jaime Polanco</i>	263
t <sup>u</sup>	Employment	impacts of privatization <i>Ralph van der Hoeven and HellaHoppe</i>	267
19:		Women's rights under privatization: The example of Bulgaria, Poland, Russia and the Ukraine <i>Anne Zollner</i>	271
g <sup>oi</sup>	Environmental	impacts of privatization <i>Ernst Ulrich von Weizsacker</i>	278
S <sub>ea</sub>		Does privatization provide the right choice of choice? Observations from the UK <i>Roger Levett</i>	282

## PART IV GOVERNANCE OF PRIVATIZATION

this			
jeoj		<b>Initial remarks</b> <i>Oran R. Young</i>	289
"	<b>Regulation</b>	<i>Matthias Finger</i>	291
*		Example: Water privatization working for the poor - first dos and don'ts of regulation <i>RalfSudhoff</i>	298
jL		Example: Accountability instead of privatization - The Parana (Brazil) school performance report cards <i>Alcyone Vasconcelos</i> and <i>Simon Schwartzman</i>	304
f <sup>n</sup>			
& <sup>n</sup>			
effi <sub>c</sub>			
<sup>l</sup> &	<b>Privatization and Municipal Democracy</b> <i>Nele Schneidereit and Ernst Ulrich von Weizsacker</i>		307
strei			
	<b>Financing Global Public Goods: Challenges</b> <i>IngeKaul</i>		311
sus <sup>t</sup> :		Example: Private funding of infrastructure in developing countries <i>Peter Wolff</i>	318

**Escaping Pernicious Dualism: Civil Society between the  
State and the Firm** *Teodor Shanin and Ernst Ulrich von Weizsacker* 325

**% Private Governance: Private Rules for Privatization?**  
*Marianne Beisheim* 328

Example: The 'CSR navigator' *Bjorn Stigson and Margaret Flaherty* 334

**'Co-evolution' between State Regulation and the Private  
Sector** *Raimund Bleischwitz* 341

## **PART V CONCLUSION**

**Lessons Learned from Privatization** *Ernst Ulrich von Weizsacker,  
Oran R. Young, Matthias Finger and Marianne Beisheim* 351

**About the Editors and Authors** 363  
**Notes** 369  
**List of Acronyms and Abbreviations** 378  
**References** 383  
**Index** 407